

Reference No: 10/02013/LIB
Applicant: Eilean Eisdeal
Proposal: Installation of Solar PV Panels and Air Source Heat Pump
Site Address: Easdale Island Community Hall, Easdale Island

DECISION ROUTE

Local Government Scotland Act 1973

(A) THE APPLICATION

(i) Development Requiring Listed Building Consent

- Installation of 14 Solar PV Panels
 - Installation of Air Source Heat Pump
-

(B) RECOMMENDATION:

Having due regard to the Development Plan and all other material considerations, it is recommended that listed building consent be granted subject to the conditions and reasons set out in this report.

(C) HISTORY:

02/00057/DET

Renovation of Drill Hall (Revised Proposals) – granted: 06/03/02

02/00095/LIB

Renovation of Drill Hall (Revised Proposals) – granted: 06/03/02

00/01893/DET

Renovation of Drill Hall – granted 05/04/01

01/00008/LIB

Renovation of Drill Hall – granted 05/04/01

(D) CONSULTATIONS:

Historic Scotland

Letter dated 16/02/11 advising no locus on this particular case as the alterations are to a Category C(s) Listed Building.

Seil and Easdale Community Council

E-mail dated 20/02/11 advising that *"they urge caution on the grounds of noise and visual impact on the Conservation Area"*.

(E) PUBLICITY:

The proposal has been advertised in terms of Conservation Area and Listed Building procedures, closing dated 06/01/11.

(F) REPRESENTATIONS:

Representations have been received from 27 individuals as follows:

24 objections, 3 support

OBJECTIONS

Hamish Munton, The Old Inn, Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil

L Munton, The Old Inn, Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil

Mr Henry Tarbatt, 33a Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Jenny Smith, 33a Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

David Simcox, 60 Ellenabeich, Easdale, Oban, PA34 4RQ (2 representations)

David A Simcox, The Convent, Rockfield Road, Oban, PA34 5DQ

Mrs I Coombes, 25 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

E Munton, Creel Cottage, 64 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, PA34 4RF

S Cooper, Creel Cottage, 64 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, PA34 4RF

M M MacLellan, 8 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, Oban, PA34 4RQ

D Robertson, 42 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, Oban, PA34 4RQ

Mrs S Fairbairn, 9A Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Rose Sampson, 13B Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

C L Davies, 2 Pipers Road, Cairnbaan, Lochgilphead, PA31 8UF

Ruth Morris, 61 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, Oban, PA34 4RQ

George Doyle, 41 Ellenabeich, Isle Of Seil, Oban, PA34 4RQ

Meurig Jones, 10 Kerrisk Drive, Dunfermline, Fife, KY11 8RG

A Clayton, 46 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Stuart A Clayton, 46 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Heather Chaplin 3 Easdale Island Oban PA34 4TB (3 representations)

Mrs Margaret Jones, 10 Kerrisk Drive, Dunfermline, Fife, KY11 8RG

Miss Susan Jones, 11f Auckland Crescent, JHQ – Monchengladback, 41179, Germany

Elizabeth Rhodes, 49 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Easdale Island Residents And Property Owner's Association, C/o Keith Oversby, 55 Easdale Island, PA34 4TB

(i) Summary of objections raised

- The proposal is contrary to Policies LP ENV 1, LP ENV 13(a), LP ENV 14, LP BAD 1 and LP REN 3

Comment: The proposal is assessed against the relevant policies in Appendix A of this report.

- The proposed PV panels and air source heat pump are inappropriate developments on a Listed Building and would have a negative setting on all the Listed Buildings on Easdale Island.

Comment: This is assessed in Appendix A of this report.

- The proposed PV panels and air source heat pump are inappropriate developments within a Conservation Area and would undermine the status of Conservation Area.

Comment: This is assessed in Appendix A of this report.

- The proposed air source heat pump is unsightly and would result in noise disturbance to residents, workers and visitors to Easdale Island and Ellenabeich.

Comment: The Council's Public Protection Unit raised no objection subject to a condition regarding suitable noise attenuation measures. This is discussed in further detail in Appendix A of this report.

- The hall is not insulated and this should be the priority.

Comment: The hall is insulated to the requirements of the Building Regulations in force at the time of its renovation.

- The installation process and the weight of the pv panels could affect the stability of the roof.

Comment: This is not a material consideration in the determination of the planning application.

- Eilean Eisdeal has failed to act in an open and transparent manner and is not in a position to claim to represent the consensus of the views of the Easdale Island 'community'.

Comment: This is not a material consideration in the determination of this planning application.

- The equipment has a finite life and requires maintenance. Islanders will be left with an expensive debt once the main sponsors withdraw their funding.

Comment: This is not a material consideration in the determination of this planning application.

- It is not possible to assess the visual impact and the potential benefits of the solar pv without sizing, weight and rating information.

Comment: The plans are to scale and show the size and location of the pv panels. In addition the applicant has provided a detailed specification which shows their appearance. It is therefore considered that sufficient information has been provided to allow the Council to fully assess the application.

- No details of the type of solar pv panels have been submitted.

Comment: The application is accompanied by the manufacturer's literature which specifies a multicrystal photovoltaic module.

SUPPORT

Mrs Pamela Carr, 60 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Voirrey Quillin, 1a Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

Steve Brown, 56 Easdale Island, Oban, PA34 4TB

(ii) Summary of support raised

- The project will enable the community hall to be heated by sustainable, green energy.
- The project will provide funding to the community for at least the next 20 years enabling a multitude of projects from maintenance of the B Listed Harbour to funding an arts programme.
- The proposal represents a good example of community practice and will have a positive impact on the island.
- The proposal is fully consistent with the Scottish Government's policy on renewable.

The above represents a summary of the issues raised. Full details of the letters of representation are available on the Council's Public Access System by clicking on the following link <http://www.argyll-bute.gov.uk/content/planning/publicaccess>.

(i) List of all Development Plan Policy considerations taken into account in assessment of the application.

Argyll and Bute Structure Plan 2002

STRAT DC 1 – Development within the Settlements

STRAT DC 8 – Landscape and Development Control

STRAT DC 9 – Historic Environment and Development Control

Argyll and Bute Local Plan 2009

LP BAD 1 – Bad Neighbour Development

LP ENV 1 – Impact on the General Environment

LP ENV 13a – Development Impact on Listed Buildings

LP ENV 14 – Conservation Areas and Special Built Environment Areas

Appendix A – Sustainable Siting and Design Principles

(ii) List of all other material planning considerations taken into account in the assessment of the application.

The Town & Country Planning Act (Scotland) 1997

The Planning etc. (Scotland) Act, 2006

SPP, Scottish Planning Policy, 2010

Planning Advice Note 45 : Renewable Energy Technologies

Scottish Historic Environment Policy, 2009

(G) Assessment and summary of determining issues and material considerations

In terms of the adopted Argyll and Bute Local Plan, the site is situated within the minor Settlement Zone of Easdale within which Policy STRAT DC 1 of the approved Argyll and Bute Structure Plan gives encouragement to small scale development which is compatible with an essentially rural settlement location.

The property is a Category C(s) Listed Building within which Policy LP ENV 13(a), Development Impact on Listed Buildings states the development affecting a listed building or its setting shall preserve the building or its setting, and any features of special architectural or historic interest that it possesses.

The building is also situated within the Easdale Conservation Area within which Policy LP ENV 14, Development in Conservation Areas and Special Built Environment Areas states that there is a presumption against development that does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of an existing or proposed Conservation Area or its setting.

The main issues in respect of the proposal are the impact of the PV panels and air source heat pump on the Listed Building and Conservation Area.

In addition to the above, the proposal also has to be assessed for compliance with other relevant local plan policies which are detailed in Appendix A of this report.

The proposal has elicited a large number of objections from residents of the Island.

The proposed photovoltaic panels and air source heat pump are considered to be acceptable alterations to the Listed Building and would not appear as significantly dominant or intrusive features which would detract from the buildings appearance or its setting within the Conservation Area.

On the basis of the foregoing, the proposal is considered to be acceptable and to accord with the relevant Development Plan policies and I recommend that Listed Building Consent be granted subject to the conditions appended to this report.

(H)	Is the proposal consistent with the Development Plan:	Yes
------------	--	------------

(I)	Need for notification to Scottish Ministers or Historic Scotland:	No
------------	--	-----------

Author of Report: **Fiona Scott** **Date:** 21/03/11

Reviewing Officer: **Angus Gilmour** **Date:** 30/03/11

Angus Gilmour
Head of Planning and Regulatory Services

CONDITIONS AND REASONS RELATIVE TO APPLICATION REFERENCE 10/02013/LIB

1. That the development to which this permission relates must be begun within five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

2. No development shall commence on site until full details of noise attenuation measures to the air source heat pump in order to provide a minimum of 10 dB reduction in the level of the transmitted noise have been submitted to, and approved in writing by the Planning Authority in consultation with the Public Protection Unit. Thereafter, the air source heat pump shall not be operated above the approved noise levels.

Reason: In order to protect the amenities of the area.

3. No development shall commence on site until full details, in plan form, of a form of screening for the air source heat pump has been submitted to, and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. Such details shall comprise a natural stone finish to match the community hall building.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and to ensure that the proposals do not adversely affect the architectural and historic character of the building and its setting within the Conservation Area.

APPENDIX A – RELATIVE TO APPLICATION NUMBER: 10/02013/LIB

PLANNING LAND USE AND POLICY ASSESSMENT

A. Settlement Strategy

In terms of the adopted Argyll and Bute Local Plan, the site is situated within the minor Settlement Zone of Easdale within which Policy STRAT DC 1 of the approved Argyll and Bute Structure Plan gives encouragement to small scale development which is compatible with an essentially rural settlement location.

The property is a Category C(s) Listed Building within which Policy LP ENV 13(a), Development Impact on Listed Buildings states the development affecting a listed building or its setting shall preserve the building or its setting, and any features of special architectural or historic interest that it possesses.

The building is also situated within the Easdale Conservation Area within which Policy LP ENV 14, Development in Conservation Areas and Special Built Environment Areas state that there is a presumption against development that does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of an existing or proposed Conservation Area or its setting.

The main issues in respect of the proposal are the impact of the photovoltaic panels and air source heat pump on the Listed Building and Conservation Area.

In addition to the above, the proposal also requires to be assessed for compliance with other relevant local plan policies which are detailed below.

The proposal has elicited a large number of objections from residents of the Island.

B. Location, Nature and Design of Proposed Development

Listed Building Consent is sought for the installation of 14 photovoltaic (pv) panels) and an air source heat pump to the Easdale Island Community Hall.

The community hall is a Category C(s) Listed Building situated within the Easdale Conservation Area.

The hall is a single storey structure with a pyramidal roof which was extensively refurbished and extended a number of years ago.

Each individual pv panel measures 1500mm x 990mm and the 3kW array of panels is predicted to have an annual average output of electricity of around 2400kWh.

The application shows the pv panels installed on the roof planes of the hall, 10 on the rear (southeast) elevation and the remaining four on the side (southwest) elevation. The rear elevation is the least visible elevation and is not visible from many public vantage points on the island. Given the pyramidal roof of the hall and the existing horizontal banks of glazing which break up the natural slate roof, it is considered that it lends itself well to the introduction of the pv panels which will not detract from the character of the building, nor cause an undesirable visual impact on the buildings setting within the wider conservation area.

The air source heat pump is to be installed to the front (northwest) elevation of the hall with a drystone wall enclosure and measures 661 (length) x 167 (width) x 1290 (height).

The Council's Public Protection Unit was consulted on the proposal and, whilst acknowledging that the location and operation of the plant is likely to present noise problems to the surrounding residential properties, particularly during night time hours, raised no objection subject to the submission of suitable noise attenuation measures to the plant in order to provide a minimum of 13dB reduction in the level of transmitted noise. This is adequately controlled by means of a suspensive planning condition, which safeguards the neighbouring properties and prevents development from commencing until such time as a suitable noise control plan has been agreed with the Public Protection Unit.

C. Built Environment

The site is situated on Easdale Island which has been designated in its entirety as a Conservation Area.

Structure Plan Policy DC 9, Historic Environment and Development Control states that protection, conservation, enhancement and positive management of the historic environment is promoted. Development that damages or undermines the historic architectural or cultural qualities of the historic environment will be resisted, particularly if it would affect a Scheduled Ancient Monument or its setting, other recognised architectural site of national or regional importance, listed building or its setting, conservation area or historic garden and designed landscape.

Policy LP ENV 14, Development in Conservation Areas and Special Built Environment Areas state that there is a presumption against development that does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of an existing or proposed Conservation Area or its setting.

Policy LP ENV 13(a), Development Impact on Listed Buildings, states that development affecting a listed building or its setting shall preserve the building or its setting and any features of special architectural or historic interest that it possesses. considered it will provide an acceptable contrast between the old and the modern and it is not considered

Accordingly, as a development affecting a Listed Building and within a Conservation Area, in deciding whether consent should be granted it is necessary to consider whether the pv panels and air source heat pump would prejudice the overall character of the Listed Building and its setting within the Conservation Area, thereby undermining the purpose of designation.

The conclusion in this case, is that whilst the pv panels and air source heat pump will be visible features on the Listed Building and within the Conservation Area, it is not considered they would appear over dominant or intrusive features on the building or within the wider landscape and would not be so significant as to undermine the purposes of Listing or Conservation Area designation. Furthermore, the pv panels and air source heat pump will have no significant adverse impact on the setting of other Listed Buildings within the village.

In this regard it is not considered that the proposal will have an adverse impact on the building or its setting within the surrounding area and is consistent with the criteria set out in Policies DC 8, STRAT DC 9, LP ENV 13(a) and LP ENV 14 which seek to ensure that developments do not have an adverse impact on the character of the built environment.